

Archivum
Fratrum Prædicatorum
Nova Series
Volumen V

Archivum Fratrum Prædicatorum

1 (1931) - 83 (2013)

Nova Series

1 (2016) -



This periodical is indexed in the ATLA Catholic Periodical and Literature Index® (ATLA CPLI®), [www: http://www.atla.com](http://www.atla.com)
ISSN 0391-7320

Director: Viliam Štefan DÓCI OP

Secretarius redactionis: Fabio SIMONELLI

Comitatus redactionis: Alessandra BARTOLOMEI ROMAGNOLI (Roma), Gianni FESTA OP (Roma), Gabriel Peter HUNČAGA OP (Zvolen), Augustin LAFFAY OP (Roma), Massimo MANCINI OP (Bologna), Mario MARINI OP (Roma), Agata PINCELLI (Roma)

Comitatus scientificus: Barbara BEAUMONT OP (Fanjeaux), Nicole BÉRIOU (Paris), Giorgio CARVALE (Roma), Philippe CHENAUX (Roma), Emma CONDELLO (Roma), Philippe DENIS OP (Durban), Alfonso ESPONERA CERDÀN OP (Valencia), Cynthia FOLQUER OP (Buenos Aires), Alicia FRASCHINA (Buenos Aires), Tomasz GALUSZKA OP (Kraków), Eleanor GIRAUD (Oxford), Paul-Bernard HODEL OP (Fribourg), Johnny Grandjean Gøgsig JAKOBSEN (Copenhagen), Christian LEITMEIR (Oxford), M. Michèle MULCHAHEY (Toronto), David ORIQUE OP (Providence), Riccardo PARMEGGIANI (Bologna), Thomas PRÜGL (Wien), Marco RAININI OP (Milano), Klaus-Bernward SPRINGER (Köln), Augustine THOMPSON OP (Berkeley), Eugenio Martín TORRES TORRES OP (Querétaro), John VIDMAR OP (Providence)

Secretariatatus redactionis:

Istituto Storico Domenicano
Largo Angelicum 1 – 00184 Roma (Italia)
bibliotheca@institutumhistoricum.op.org

Elaborazione grafica della copertina

© Giulia Carpignoli | Giovanni Romagnoli

Le pubblicazioni dell'Istituto Storico dell'Ordine dei Predicatori sono edite con la collaborazione della Pontificia Università San Tommaso d'Aquino, Roma.

I contributi, di cui gli autori sono responsabili circa il contenuto, prima di essere pubblicati sono sottoposti al previo esame da parte del Comitato scientifico.

Prior to being published, contributions are reviewed by the Scientific Committee, however authors are responsible for their content.

Registrazione al Tribunale di Roma n. 162/2016 del 19.VII.2016

INSTITUTUM HISTORICUM ORDINIS PRÆDICATORUM - ROMÆ

ARCHIVUM FRATRUM PRÆDICATORUM

NOVA SERIES
VOLUMEN V
2020

ANGELICUM UNIVERSITY PRESS
LARGO ANGELICUM, 1
I-00184 ROMA

„AD MARCHIAS ...“
KRITISCHE ÜBERLEGUNGEN ZUR REISE DES HEILIGEN
DOMINIKUS IN DIE MARKEN*

VON
PHILIPP THOMAS WOLLMANN

2021 wird sich der Todestag des hl. Dominikus zum 800sten Mal jähren. Dabei hat dieser Heilige durch seine Ordensgründung in bedeutender Weise an der Ausbildung des christlichen Abendlands mitgewirkt. Man möchte meinen, dass die bereits jahrhundertalte Forschung zu dieser bedeutenden Persönlichkeit des Mittelalters alle Probleme erörtert hat. Obwohl mittlerweile die Zahl an internationalen Publikationen und Aufsätzen zur Person oder zum Orden nahezu unüberblickbar ist, gibt es immer wieder neue Aspekte, die es zu beachten gilt. Allerdings demonstriert dies auch, wie ungebrochen die Faszination für den hl. Dominikus heute noch ist. Dazu dürfte wohl auch die Übersetzung der verschiedenen Quellenwerke in die jeweiligen Landessprachen beigetragen haben.¹

Abkürzungen:

Monumenta Germaniae Historica Diplomata = MGH DD

Monumenta Germaniae Historica Scriptorum = MGH SS

Regesta Imperii = RI

* In Gedenken an Pater Dr. Dr. Wolfram Hoyer OP (9. Juni 1969 - 30. Juli 2020), welcher die Veröffentlichung dieses Aufsatzes, der aus den Gesprächen mit ihm entstand und ohne nicht geschrieben worden wäre, nicht mehr erleben durfte. „Wir haben gemeint und meinen, wir brauchen sie noch. Gott hat gemeint, es sei genug.“

¹ So wurde etwa der *Libellus de initiis Ordinis Praedicatorum* des Jordan von Sachsen sowohl ins Französische als auch ins Deutsche übersetzt, s. Wolfram HOYER, *Jordan von Sachsen - Ordensmeister; Geschichtsschreiber; Beter. Eine Textsammlung* (Dominikanische Quellen und Zeugnisse, 3), Leipzig 2002 und Marie-Humbert VICAIRE, *Saint Dominique de Caleruega d'après les documents du XIII^e siècle*, Paris 1955. Zuletzt durch das monumentale Sammel- und Übersetzungswerk *Saint Dominique de l'ordre des frères prêcheurs. Témoignages écrits fin XII^e-XIV^e siècle. Textes traduits, annotés et présentés par Nicole BÉRIOU et Bernard HODEL avec la collaboration de Gisèle BESSON*, Paris 2019.

Häuser passen würde. Das unbekannte *marchia* im Bericht des Jordan von Sachsen mit der Mark Istrien zu identifizieren würde zudem noch weitere Aspekte erfüllen: Die beschwerliche Reise des Bischofs von Osma wäre mit der Durchquerung weiter Teile der Alpen zu erklären. Zudem ist die päpstliche Kurie von Istrien aus in nur wenigen Tagesreisen erreichbar, was die Entscheidung zum Besuch dieser nach der zweiten gescheiterten Legation nachvollziehbar erscheinen lässt. Schließlich könnte der Bischof Diego von Osma an der Grenze zu Ungarn auf die Kumanen gestoßen sein, welche um diese Zeit durchaus dort anzutreffen waren.⁹⁴ Alles in allem scheint somit ein begründeter Verdacht vorzuliegen, der es durchaus würdig ist, weiter diskutiert zu werden. Jedenfalls dürfte hiermit die dänische Hypothese ausgeschlossen sein.

Abstract

One of the most difficult parts of the edition of a medieval text is the identification of mentioned persons and locations. Some of these were discussed multiple times but have not been able to be completely identified yet. One example is S. Dominic's journey into the marches, mentioned by Jordan of Saxony in the 14th chapter of his *Libellus de Principiis Ordinis Praedicatorum*. Jordan told us, that the bishop of Osma together with his deacon Dominic were sent to a noble of the marches by king Alfonso of Castile in order to search for a suitable marriage for the king's son. This episode – may have taken place around 1203-1204 – was later supplemented by Gerhard of Frachet and Bernard Gui. Both added *Dacie* into the text to help the reader with the identification of the marches. The modern history research took that into account in order to equate the terminus *marchia Dacie* with Denmark or the northgerman marches. Despite searches in the sources of the 12th century and first half of the 13th century a terminus technicus like this could not be found for Denmark. Instead the sources used *regnum Dacie* for the kingdom and *rex Dacie* for the ruler title. According to that it seems impossible to identify Jordans *marchia* with Denmark. This circumstance suggests the existence of other possibilities.

⁹⁴ Vgl. Hansgerd GÖCKENJAN, *Kumanen*, in *Lexikon des Mittelalters*, Bd. 5, München-Zürich 1991, Sp. 1568f. und weiterführend dazu Dimitri KOROBENIKOV, *A broken mirror: the Kıpçak world in the thirteenth century*, in *The other Europe in the Middle Ages. Avars, Bulgars, Khazars, and Cumans*, hrsg. von Florin CURTA (East Central and Eastern Europe in the Middle Ages, 450-1450, Bd. 2), Leiden 2008, S. 379-412.

By researching the conceptual context of the term *marchia* in the charters of king Philipp of Swabia and emperor Friedrich II. as well as the historiographical sources of the time, which are edited in the series of the *Monumenta Germaniae Historica* (MGH), it is possible to work out the marches of Italy, Krain, Istria and Meissen as the most common used paraphrases with *marchia*. Putting this into consideration, there were two dynasties in the marches of Meissen and Istria, the Wettiner and the Andechs-Meranier, fulfilling the conditions of having an actual spouse for the Castilian Royalty, whereas the Italian Municipalities can be excluded. In direct comparison it seems more likely, that a daughter of Duke Berthold IV. of Andechs-Meranien might have been the candidate for the marriage. It can be concluded that Jordans *marchia* has to be named as the march of Istria, with other evidence also suggesting this.

AQUINAS AND THE PLACE OF CANON LAW IN LEGAL HISTORY

BY

LYDIA SCHUMACHER - DAVID D'AVRAY

The surprising finding of this short note is that in the eyes of Aquinas canon law has practically no place in legal history. To be clear: Aquinas knew all about canon law. It was quite normal for Dominicans to read the *Decretum* of Gratian and the *Liber Extra*, the official compilation promulgated by Gregory IX in 1234. Instructions of Humbert of Romans on the Offices of the Dominican Order say that it pertains to the librarian (*librarius*) that in some suitable and quiet place there should be one or more large lecterns at which may be read certain books, clearly written, which when they are available are much in demand from the friars: and he includes the *Decretum* and *Liber Extra* in his list.¹ Aquinas must have been well aware of canon law's role in the life of the Church, and about its place in the universities of his day; and even if Bologna was the greatest centre for canon law, it had an important role at the university of Paris too.²

Aquinas himself quotes canon law authorities frequently. In the *Summa Theologiae* he cites Gratian's *Decretum* 81 times.³ Had he finished the *Summa* there would have been many more references to this work. In his treatment of marriage in his *Sentences* Commentary,

¹ *Instructiones Magistri Humberti de Officiis Ordinis: II, B. Humberti de Romanis Opera de Vita Regulari*, ed. by Joachim Joseph BERTHIER, 2 vols., Torino 1956, p. 265: 'Item, ad ipsum pertinet providere quod in aliquo loco silentii et apto, sit aliquis pulpitus magnus, vel plures, in quibus legentur aliqui libri bene legibiles, quibus frequentius fratres indigent cum habentur, ut est ... Decreta, Decretales ...'

² Nathalie GOROCHOV, *Naissance de l'université. Les écoles de Paris d'Innocent III à Thomas d'Aquin (v. 1200-1245)*, Paris 2016, pp. 540-548.

³ Kenneth PENNINGTON, *Lex Naturalis and Ius Naturale*, in *The Jurist*, 68 (2008), pp. 569-591, at p. 578. For a recent study showing awareness of canon law on the part of theologians see Elsa MARMURSZTEJN, *Loi ancienne, loi nouvelle, et normes chrétiennes dans la théologie scolastique du XIII^e siècle*, in *Revue de l'histoire des religions*, 228 (2011), pp. 509-539.

distinct until the later decades of the twelfth century.⁴⁶ Perhaps Aquinas thought of canon law as theology, rather than as law. That would resolve the contradiction between his close familiarity with it and his omission of it from his schema of law. But we may have to resign ourselves to identifying the fact without fully explaining it.

Abstract

Thomas Aquinas includes in the *Summa Theologiae* a typology of law which can be read as an almost book length global history. Canon law, however, is virtually left out: it gets part of a single sentence. Investigation of earlier theologians shows that they too left canon law out of their typologies of law. The omission is stranger in Aquinas however because he gives much more space than his predecessors to secular human positive law. The article draws attention to this puzzling, non-trivial negative fact. One explanation might be the suspicion in which theologians held their materially successful canon law colleagues. Another, more charitable, is that Aquinas and his predecessors continued a twelfth century tradition in which canon law was not differentiated from applied theology.

⁴⁶ Paul FOURNIER - Gabriel LE BRAS, *Histoire des collections canoniques depuis les fausses décrétées jusqu'au Décret de Gratien*, I, Paris 1931, pp. 370-371; Martin BRETT, *Finding the Law. The Sources of Canonical Authority Before Gratian*, in *Law before Gratian. Law in Western Europe c. 500-1100. Proceedings of the Third Carlsberg Academy Conference on Medieval Legal History 2006*, ed. by Per ANDERSEN - Mia MÜNSTER-SWENDSEN - Helle VOGT, Copenhagen 2006, pp. 51-72, at p. 72; Frank REXROTH, *Kodifizierung und Auslegen. Symbolische Grenzziehungen zwischen päpstlich-gesetzgeberischer und gelehrter Praxis im späteren Mittelalter (1209/10-1317)*, in *Frühmittelalterliche Studien*, 41 (2008), pp. 395-414, at p. 398: 'Für die Zeit Papst Alexanders III. (1159-1181) sind Theologie und Kirchenrecht noch nicht zu unterscheiden.'; BRUNDAGE, *The Medieval Battle*, p. 277.

BLACK FRIARS IN A NORTHERN EUROPEAN HANSEATIC CITY:
THE DOMINICANS OF ST MARY MAGDALEN IN LÜBECK
(C. 1227/29-1531)

BY
FREDERIK FELSKAU

In 2015, the former Dominican friary in the Hanseatic city of Lübeck in Northern Germany was integrated into the exhibition space of the newly founded *Europäisches Hansemuseum*.¹ The fragmented history of the friary is itself strongly connected with the Reformation which led to the dissolution of the convent in 1531 and the subsequent chequered usage of the building.² The disappearance of the Order from the city and of Catholic monasticism in the region shaped the research

¹ I am grateful to Prof. Klaus-Bernward Springer for his thorough and very helpful supervision and his numerous suggestions during the preparation of this essay. My thanks also go to the proofreaders Sr. Sabine Schratz OP and Sr. Brighde Valley OP for their excellent work.

On the museum: Felicia STERNFELD (ed.), *Katalog des Europäischen Hansemuseums Lübeck*, Lübeck 2016, with a contribution of Tatjana DÜBBEL on the friary on pp. 90-93; homepage of the museum on <http://www.hansemuseum.eu/language/de/>. The church was torn down in 1819 due to disrepair; cf. DENKMALRAT DER HANSESTADT LÜBECK, *Die Klöster; die kleineren Gotteshäuser der Stadt, die Kirchen und Kapellen in den Aussengebieten, Denk- und Wegekreuze und der Leidensweg Christi* (Die Bau- und Kunstdenkmäler der freien und Hansestadt Lübeck, 4), Lübeck 1928, repr. 2001, s.v. „Burgkloster“, pp. 167-280, here esp. 169 f.

² On the archival tradition see Archiv der Hansestadt Lübeck (the archive henceforth abbr. as AHL), *Bestand 5.2-05: Burgkloster*, and *ibid.*, *Bestand 7.1-2-07: Sacra B4*. Most of the charters of these fonds were incorporated into the *Urkundenbuch der Stadt Lübeck. Codex diplomaticus Lubecensis*, ed. by VEREIN FÜR LÜBECKISCHE GESCHICHTE, 11 vols., Lübeck 1843-1932; this source henceforth abbr. as UStL. The cartulary of the Black Friars with entries from 1317 to 1503, of which the entries up the year 1470 is mostly, but not completely considered in the UStL. It is to be edited by Hiram KÜMPER, *Das Fragmentum libri copialis monasterii Lubecensis Dominicani* [forthcoming]. Those documents of the cartulary which did not enter the UStL are abbr. here as Kopiar. Other unpublished sources of this stock (*Sacra B4* or *Burgkloster*) henceforth abbr. as AHL-BK. On the stock itself: Antjekathrin GRASSMANN (ed.), *Beständeübersicht des Archivs der Hansestadt Lübeck* (Veröffentlichungen zur Geschichte der Hansestadt Lübeck, Reihe B, 29), Lübeck 2005, p. 214 (the series henceforth abbr. as VGHL).

Abstract

The article is dealing with the history of the Dominican priory St Mary Magdalen in Lübeck covering the time span from foundation to dissolution. The initial part discusses the context, local conditions and strategic goals connected with the arrival and the embedding of the friars (part A). Then, the development and the positioning of the Burgkloster within the Dominican Order with particular emphasis on the scholastic organisation is presented, and its role within the urban history and the broader politics is described. Within this part B one paragraph investigates the economic parameters of the priory. The final part summarizes the role of the Burgkloster within Pre-Reformational piety and reflects on the path towards dissolution (part C). The conclusive remarks raise the question of a particular identity of the Dominicans in Lübeck and future research to be done on the friary (part D).

STATUS QUAESTIONIS SOBRE LA IRRADIACIÓN DE LA
REFORMA DE LA PROVINCIA DE ESPAÑA DESDE 1516
HASTA FINALES DEL SIGLO XVI

POR
ALFONSO ESPONERA CERDÁN OP

La escasa bibliografía que ha estudiado la reforma, “reformación” es el término que utilizan con frecuencia las fuentes, de los dominicos de la provincia de España y su irradiación en las vecinas provincias de Aragón y Portugal, respectivamente, desde 1516 y 1536 hasta finales de este siglo XVI, tiene unos trabajos pioneros y de referencia en 1939, como son los de Vicente Beltrán de Heredia o.p., entre ellos, su *Historia de la Reforma de la Provincia de España (1450-1550)*, que han recibido algunas posteriores aportaciones de otras investigaciones, sin olvidar la publicación de nuevas y diversas fuentes documentales vinculadas con este tema. Su actual *status quaestionis* es lo que se va a presentar en este trabajo.

1. *Sentido de la expresión “claustrales” y “observantes”*

Los dos bloques que se fueron generando en las órdenes mendicantes hispánicas por su reforma parecería ser que según Garci Rodríguez de Montalvo (c. 1450-c. 1505), «[a unos] la gente seglar les llamaba por mofa *claustrales* porque no guardaban clausura y tenían abiertos los claustros y puertas de los monasterios para cuantos querían entrar y salir de ellos.»¹ Estos fueron también denominados “conventuales”, o “claustrales”,² y los otros “observantes.”³

¹ *Claustral*, *Historia religiosa*, en *Enciclopedia Universal Ilustrada Europeo-Americana*, vol. 13, Madrid 1958, p. 715.

² Cf. Lorenzo DI FONZO, *Claustrali*, en *Dizionario degli Istituti di Perfezione*, Guerrino PELLICCIA - Giancarlo ROCCA (dir.), vol. 2, Roma 1975, pp. 1164-1165 y *Conventualesimo*, *ibid.*, pp. 1713-1726.

³ Cf. Henricus Wilhelmus HOPPENBROUWERS, *Observantia*, *ibid.*, vol. 6, Roma 1980, pp. 679-683; Giovanni ODOARDI, *Conventuali e Osservanti*, *ibid.*, vol. 2, Roma 1975, pp. 1708-1711.

a Diego Ramírez, prior de San Esteban de Salamanca. Después en 1607 fue igualmente nombrado el navarro Martín Ecay y todavía años más adelante, en 1623 se envió de visitador a la provincia a Domingo Pimentel, que acababa de ser provincial en la de España (1619-1623), y ascendió luego al arzobispado de Sevilla y al cardenalato. La Corona española siguió firme en su convicción de que no prosperaría la reforma sino puesta bajo el gobierno de castellanos. Pero no hay que olvidar que la señalada unión dinástica *aeque principaliter* se prolongó hasta 1640 en que comenzó la guerra de separación.

Es hora de concluir. Como ha podido observarse, en la actualidad aún quedan muchos aspectos por estudiar de la iniciada irradiación desde 1516 y 1536 de la reforma de los dominicos de la provincia de España en las vecinas provincias de Aragón y Portugal hasta finales del siglo XVI.

Abstract

This paper offers the *status quaestionis* of the studies on the elucidation of the Reform of the Dominican Province of Spain and the neighboring Provinces of Aragon and Portugal, initiated in 1516 and 1536, respectively, until the end of sixteen century. The role played by the former in the reform of the other two remains to be disputed matter, as well as the existence of the previous and proper reform movements that were more or less successful. It also remains to be an important issue to know the impact that the Spanish Crown had in both reforms and how this aimed reform could be understood as an undesired intrusion of the friars coming from the Province of Spain. The study of the reform of the Order in the Iberian Peninsula at the beginning of the 16th century continues to be a controversial subject, plagued with questions, some of which, the present work aims to shed light.

LOS PREDICADORES DOMINICOS EN LA
CORTE DE CARLOS II (1665-1700)*

POR
FRANCISCO JOSÉ GARCÍA PÉREZ

1. *Los predicadores dominicos. Datos generales y análisis sociológico*

La Orden de Predicadores había desarrollado estrategias verdaderamente útiles para hacerse un hueco en las cortes de la Europa católica. En lo que se refiere a la Monarquía Hispánica, la sombra dominica se hallaba muy presente, principalmente por el hecho de que el soberano tenía siempre a un hijo de Santo Domingo por confesor.¹ Esto ya tenía repercusiones importantes. Los confesores del rey podían alcanzar cotas de influencia que, por lo general, solía repercutir en beneficio de la propia orden religiosa. Sin embargo, esta no era la única de las vías con las que contaban los dominicos para mantener altos márgenes de influencia política. Otra de ellas residía en la Real Capilla, y más concretamente en el título de predicador real. La función de esta figura se centraba en predicar sermones ante la familia real. Sin embargo, el tiempo revistió este título de una fama y prestigio que lo convertirían en un verdadero premio por el que valía la pena batallar.² Prueba de ello es que, al morir Felipe IV, el número de nom-

* Las abreviaturas utilizadas en este artículo son las siguientes:

AAV (Archivo Apostolico Vaticano, Città del Vaticano)

AGI (Archivo General de Indias, Sevilla)

AGP (Archivo General de Palacio, Madrid)

AHN (Archivo Histórico Nacional, Madrid)

AUSA (Archivo de la Universidad de Salamanca, Salamanca)

BNE (Biblioteca Nacional de España, Madrid).

¹ Véase Luis G. Alonso GETINO, *Dominicos españoles confesores de Reyes*, Madrid 1917.

² Juan A. SÁNCHEZ BELÉN, *Eclesiásticos criollos en la Capilla Real de Palacio: una élite de poder en el reinado de Carlos II*, en *Revista de Indias*, 261 (2014), pp. 423-452, vide p. 429.

cuando el príncipe bastardo murió en 1679, y subió al poder el nuevo favorito, duque de Medinaceli, los dominicos asumieron las nuevas dinámicas imperantes en el funcionamiento de la capilla palatina, especialmente en lo que se refiere al número de tres. Por ello, cada vez que uno entre los suyos moría o se hacía demasiado mayor para continuar subiéndose al púlpito, ya se tenía preparado a su sustituto. Esto ejemplifica, por lo tanto, los intereses que los dominicos tenían en mantener intacta su sombra en todos los resortes de la Corte.

En definitiva, y a modo de conclusión final, lo que ha quedado demostrado es que la Orden dominica jugó un papel preponderante en la Corte del último Austria, como había sido ya tradición en los reinados anteriores. Mantuvieron intacto su dominio sobre el confesionario regio en un momento en el que los jesuitas intentaban hacerse con el control de otros ámbitos de la esfera privada de los reyes -la reina madre y la consorte contaban con un jesuita como confesor- y, al mismo tiempo, blindaron su voz en los púlpitos de las principales iglesias en la órbita de la Corte. De tal modo que, cuando comenzó el siglo de los Borbones, los dominicos estaban más que preparados para mantener sus cotas de influencia tal y como estaban en el ocaso de la centuria anterior.

Abstract

This article aims to study the presence of the Dominican Order in the Royal Chapel of Charles II, and more specifically in the bank of royal preachers. Along these lines we will analyse the general characteristics of the Dominicans who obtained the title of preacher, their links with the elite and their sacred oratory in the main pulpits of Madrid. Finally, special attention will be given to the political participation of Dominican preachers and their ties to court factions.

THE END OF THE MIDDLE AGES AND RELIGIOUS RENEWAL
HEINRICH DENIFLE AND THE DEBATE ON
THE END OF THE MIDDLE AGES*

BY
RICCARDO SACCENTI

*To Patrizio Foresta
for his friendship*

The debate on the terminus of the Middle Ages runs through all the historiography on the Reformation in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. The binomial Reformation/Renaissance has been considered as the origin of European Modernity because of the connection between two different ages of European history that share some basic common features and as the link in a continuous chain in the history of European civilization. The question whether the Reformation is the beginning of Modernity or the continuity of the Middle Ages was highly disputed between the end of the nineteenth and the beginning of the twentieth centuries, in the context of the historiographical *querelle* concerning Heinrich Suso Denifle's vast inquiry *Luther und Lutherthum in der Ersten Entwicklung quellenmäßig dargestellt* (1904).¹ Denifle's work marked a turning point in the historiography concerning the Reformation. It defined some basic elements that would remain at the

* The contents of this inquiry were first presented at the 94th Annual Meeting of the Medieval Academy of America, *Global Turn in Medieval Studies*, which took place in Philadelphia in March 2019. I would like to thank Prof. David D'Avray and Prof. Werner Maleczek for their precious and invaluable support. Their suggestions and notes provided me a clearer understanding of Denifle's role in the development of Medieval studies between the end of the nineteenth and the beginning of the twentieth century. I'm also deeply grateful to Dr Lydia Schumacher, Prof. Richard Davies and Dr. Antje Foresta for their help in revising my text and translations. Certainly, the responsibility for the contents of the present essay is mine alone.

¹ Heinrich S. DENIFLE, *Luther und Lutherthum in der ersten Entwicklung quellenmäßig dargestellt*, Mainz 1904. All the translations of the quotations from Denifle's work in the pages below are my own. The German text is given in the footnotes. I decided to maintain the orthography of Denifle's book.

between historiography and theology, distinguishing the two fields and being aware of the mutual cultural influences among them.⁵¹

Like every historical interpretation, Denifle's inquiry into Luther and Lutheranism is valuable in the sense that it offers a clarification of some aspect of an event, but, it can never give the final and comprehensive description of what happened. Therefore, the Dominican scholar is able to question the features of Luther's theology and to bring to light its medieval sources. Certainly, Denifle's research depends on the late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century Catholic milieu. However, by the careful use of historical-critical methods of research, the scholar was able to achieve a critical and philological understanding of the complex theological roots of the Reformation.

Abstract

The publication of Heinrich Denifle's *Luther und Lutherthum in der Ersten Entwicklung quellen mäßig dargestellt* in 1904 marked a turning point in the historiography concerning the Reformation. The Dominican scholar did not merely resume the traditional Catholic apologetic against Protestants: he largely made use of the historical-critical analysis of a vast number of sources, texts, and documents to deal with Lutheranism as a theological and religious subject. In doing so, Denifle evidences Luther's intellectual debt with the medieval theological traditions, opening a new perspective to the studies on the historical evaluation of the Reformation. This essay aims to evaluate Denifle's contribution to the historiography on Luther, particularly regarding the reading of the Reformation in relation to the Middle Ages and the Modern Age. In order to accomplish such objective, the article places the work of the Dominican scholar within its own cultural framework and recalls his intellectual and ideological features. On that basis, the essay examines the key issues of Denifle's work and considers how his approach to Luther contributed to the shaping of a historiographical perspective that continues to influence the understanding of the Reformation as a break from or continuity of the Middle Ages.

EKD hat ein ideologisches Luther-Bild, in *Die Welt* 24.05.2014, available online at <https://www.welt.de/debatte/kommentare/article128354577/Die-EKD-hat-ein-ideologisches-Luther-Bild.html>.

⁵¹ See on this the interesting idea of a "trans-confessional" historiography of the Reformation proposed in Volker LEPPIN, *Resonanzen der GER in der Erforschung der Reformation*, in *Wachsende Zustimmung und offene Fragen. Die Gemeinsame Erklärung*, ed. by Bernd OBERDORFER - Thomas SÖDING, Freiburg u.a. 2019, pp. 265-284.

AUCTORES

David D'AVRAY
Department of History UCL
Gower St London WC1E6BT, United Kingdom
ucradav@ucl.ac.uk

Alfonso ESPONERA CERDÁN OP
Facultad de Teología San Vicente Ferrer, Valencia, España
aespo.ar@dominicos.org

Frederik FELSKAU
Nohlstrasse 40
50733 Köln, Deutschland
felskau@hotmail.com

Francisco José GARCÍA PÉREZ
Instituto de Estudios Hispánicos en la Modernidad (IEHM)
Universitat de les Illes Balears
07122 Palma de Mallorca, España
f.garcia@uib.es

Riccardo SACCENTI
Università degli Studi di Bergamo
Dipartimento di Lettere, Filosofia e Comunicazione
via Pignolo 123, 24121 Bergamo, Italia
riccardo.saccenti@unibg.it

Lydia SCHUMACHER
Department of Theology and Religious Studies
Kings College
Strand, London WC2R 2LS, United Kingdom
lydia.schumacher@kcl.ac.uk

Philipp T. WOLLMANN
Monumenta Germaniae Historica
Ludwigstr. 16, 80539 München, Deutschland
philipp.t.wollmann@mgh.de

INDEX VOLUMINIS

Philipp Thomas WOLLMANN, „ <i>Ad Marchias ...</i> “ <i>Kritische Überlegungen zur Reise des Heiligen Dominikus in die Marken ...</i>	5-27
Lydia SCHUMACHER - David D'AVRAY, <i>Aquinas and the Place of Canon Law in Legal History</i>	29-44
Frederik FELSKAU, <i>Black Friars in a Northern European Hanseatic City: the Dominicans of St Mary Magdalen in Lübeck (c. 1227/29-1531)</i>	45-110
Alfonso ESPONERA CERDÁN OP, <i>Status quaestionis sobre la irradiación de la reforma de la Provincia de España desde 1516 hasta finales del siglo XVI</i>	111-166
Francisco José GARCÍA PÉREZ, <i>Los predicadores Dominicos en la Corte de Carlos II (1665-1700)</i>	167-199
Riccardo SACCENTI, <i>The End of the Middle Ages and Religious Renewal: Heinrich Denifle and the Debate on the End of the Middle Ages</i>	201-225
Recensiones	227-252
Index codicum et documentorum manuseriptorum	253-254
Index nominum	255-280
Auctores	281

*Impaginazione grafica e stampa:
Tipolitografia 2000 s.a.s. di De Magistris R. & C.
Via Trento, 46 - 00046 Grottaferrata (Rm)
Tel. 06 9410473 - tipolitografia2000@gmail.com*

Finito di stampare nel mese di gennaio 2021